

Mid-Cycle Peer-Evaluation Report

Tillamook Bay Community College

**Tillamook, OR
October 7-8, 2024**

NWCCU Liaison to the Peer Evaluation Team:

Dr. Gita Bangera

Senior Vice President, NWCCU

A confidential report of findings prepared for the
Northwest Commission on Colleges and Universities

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Visit Summary	2
Mission Fulfillment.....	3
Student Achievement	5
Programmatic Assessment	6
Addendums	8
Moving Forward.....	8

Introduction

Since its beginnings in 1981, Tillamook Community College (TBCC) has served Tillamook County, forming various partnerships with the county's school districts and establishing centers at area high schools prior to the construction of its current Third Street campus in 2009. Accredited by the Northwest Commission on Colleges and Universities (NWCCU) in 2013, TBCC is a comprehensive 2-year institution, offering over 40 associate degrees, certificates, and apprenticeship programs that prepare students for transfer to a four-year university or to directly enter the workforce. As the "education center of [its] community" TBCC is responsive, innovative, empowering, and invested in the progress of all," with a mission to "serve [its] diverse community equitably through educational excellence, community collaboration, and opportunities for lifelong learning."

TBCC was scheduled by NWCCU to undergo a Mid-Cycle Peer Evaluation in Fall 2024 as part of the next regular accreditation cycle following its comprehensive Evaluation of Institutional Effectiveness (EIE) in Fall 2021. As such, a three-person peer evaluation team acting on behalf of NWCCU reviewed TBCC's Mid-Cycle Self-Evaluation report and conducted an onsite visit on October 7-8, 2024. NWCCU Senior Vice President, Dr. Gita Bangera, served as the NWCCU liaison to the evaluation team.

The purpose of the evaluation team's visit was to provide feedback to TBCC in the areas of mission fulfillment, student achievement, and program assessment and their readiness to meet the requirements and Standards of the college's next comprehensive EIE report and site visit, scheduled for Fall 2028. TBCC did not receive any Recommendations following its Fall 2021 EIE that required follow-up by the Mid-Cycle peer evaluation team; however, as the Fall 2021 EIE visit was conducted virtually, the team completed the U.S. Department of Education (USDE) Virtual Visit Certification. This certification required (1) a review of TBCC's facilities, (2) verification that these facilities are accessible, safe, secure, sufficient in quantity, and have adequate resources and infrastructure, (3) confirmation that employee evaluations are being conducted according to TBCC's policies, and (4) verification that TBCC's library resources are able to support its mission and degrees offered.

The evaluation team received a succinct and well-prepared Mid-Cycle Self-Evaluation report. The report included a helpful diagram to illustrate its institutional effectiveness model, tables with peer comparator data, and several links to supporting information and evidence, including TBCC's data dashboards, examples of program and service area reviews, and other published reports and handouts. During the visit, TBCC provided the evaluation team with additional materials. These included a summary and progress report on initiatives that align with the college's five priorities outlined in its strategic plan, an example of Service Area Agreements (SAOs) from the Noncredit Workforce Development and Community Education area, a summary prepared by the Allied Health Dean on how her programs are addressing Standard 1.C., and TBCC's "placemat", which summarizes TBCC's mission, vision, values, strategic priorities,

objectives, and initiatives, as well as summary of TBCC's progress on strategic measures within its five priorities towards fulfilling its mission. Upon request, evaluators were promptly provided with examples of its student learning outcomes assessment reflections as well as examples of course content and outcomes guides (CCOGs) which are reviewed and approved by TBCC's Curriculum Committee.

We especially thank Erin McCarley, Director of Institutional Effectiveness and TBCC's Accreditation Liaison Officer, and her team for their excellent work in developing the Mid-Cycle report, helping to provide additional information, and coordinating with us prior to and during the site visit. We also extend our sincere gratitude to Lorie Lund, Executive Assistant to the College President and Board of Education, for her exceptional hospitality and going above and beyond to make sure we were well-accommodated during our visit.

Visit Summary

During the visit, members of the TBCC community were welcoming and participatory during meetings, providing the evaluation team with greater insight into the college's report and activities around strategic planning and mission fulfillment, operationalizing TBCC's strategic plan, the use of data for informed decision making and resource allocation, student achievement, program review, and learning outcomes assessment. Evaluators also interviewed representatives from Human Resources, Facilities, and the Library towards verification of the criteria outlined in the USDE Virtual Visit Certification. Meetings were informative and provided adequate time for the evaluation team to ask prepared and follow-up questions as needed. The team met with several individuals and groups that spanned the organizational areas of the college, including:

- President Jarrell
- Executive Leadership Team:
 - Chief Financial Officer
 - Director of Institutional Research
 - Executive Director Advancement and Foundation
 - Executive Director of Facilities and Safety
 - Executive Director of Technology
 - Senior Manager of Human Resources
 - VP of Instruction
 - VP of Student Services
- Director of Opportunity Programs
- Interim Director of Student Success
- Director of the Small Business Development Center
- Director of Library and Learning Services
- Program Coordinator Community Education and Workforce
- Registrar

- Dean of Nursing and Allied Health
- Dean of Career and Technical Education
- Title III Director and Dual Credit Coordinator
- Student Success Coaches
- Arts and Letters Department Chair
- Business Administration Instructor and Department Chair
- Instructional Design and eLearning Coordinator
- Science Instructor and Curriculum Committee Chair

As our visit coincided with one of TBCC's Board of Education Meetings, the team had the unique opportunity during the Mid-Cycle visit to meet with three Board members to discuss their relationship with and support for TBCC's initiatives.

Mission Fulfillment

TBCC demonstrates a continuous process to assess institutional effectiveness via a series of indicators that align with one of five strategic priorities of their strategic plan for 2022-2029. Each priority has a series of objectives (the intended impact) and initiatives (large-scale projects to achieve the objectives). For example, with the priority of "Employee Experience & Organizational Health," TBCC is focused on improving the employee experience (objective) by utilizing employee experience data and best practices research to improve employee experiences (initiative), as measured by a net promoter score (indicator) (1.B.1). In response, the college conducted a salary equity study, and focused part of its college-wide in-service to reviewing survey data about employee morale (1.B.4).

TBCC's indicators are used to assess their effectiveness of the strategic initiatives they have implemented and furthermore are clearly intended to be indicators of mission fulfillment, as defined by the institution. TBCC is in the process of re-establishing an ongoing and systematic evaluation and planning process that can be used not only to inform and refine its effectiveness as it relates to their key metrics, but also to assign resources via their budget and resource allocation process. While the institutional indicators seem to inform and help the institution to refine its effectiveness as it relates to student achievement, TBCC would benefit from focusing on connecting student learning outcomes, in both the instructional programs and support services, to the overall assessment process (1.B.1).

TBCC has set and articulated meaningful goals, objectives, and indicators of its goals to define mission fulfillment and to improve its effectiveness in the context of and in comparison with regional and national peer institutions. Peer institutions have been identified using well-defined criteria and for each student success/student achievement metric being tracked in relation to the strategic plan. This data is clearly being used and discussed in leadership teams, college committees, and Board of Education meetings to inform decision-making and in holding the

college accountable to its mission and vision in service of the community in Tillamook County. TBCC has yet to set and articulate meaningful indicators of its equity and inclusion goals as it relates to mission fulfillment. Still, they can clearly speak to the ways in which they have adopted an equity lens as a framework for decision-making, seek to focus on service to traditionally underrepresented individuals/communities, and regularly engage in the disaggregation of data to assess effectiveness and student achievement in other ways. Going forward, the college will need to develop these indicators. TBCC has plans to apply to be recognized as a Hispanic Serving Institution by the US Department of Education and might consider how those requirements might inform the development of these metrics (1.B.2.).

TBCC's commitment to an inclusive planning process is evident in the self-evaluation report, publicly available documents on the College website, and in conversations with the faculty, staff, and Board members that participated in the site visit interviews. During the site visit, the College leadership had just proposed a formalized process for budget development, review, and approval, which engages members at every level of the organization in the allocation of resources, and also includes community members that are appointed by the board to sit on a budget committee. There is a stated desire that the Service Area Outcomes (SAOs) for support services are driving conversations and stakeholder input that managers can then use to demonstrate a need for resources, which can be further prioritized by the leadership team and vetted by the College Council before going to the Board of Education and Budget Committee for approval. Going forward, the College should also consider formalizing the structures by which the assessment of institutional effectiveness and student achievement inform the allocations of resources for support service areas. Additionally, the College should consider how alignment of the instructional program review process, the SAO review process for support services, and the budget/resource allocation cycle could further support their efforts to meet/exceed institutional metrics and close equity gaps (1.B.3.).

TBCC monitors its internal environments to identify current and emerging patterns, trends, and expectations via quarterly "data digs" and campus-wide in-service opportunities to review Service Area Outcomes from student support areas. TBCC monitors the external environment nationally, regionally, and locally and benefits from varied strong ties and connections to the local community to inform its mission and planning efforts. The Strategic Planning input report conducted in 2022 demonstrated clear community engagement in defining the future direction of the college and the way it is serving and supporting the local community. There is a clear and consistent commitment to the mission and vision of TBCC that was expressed enthusiastically and authentically by staff, faculty, administrative leaders, and Board members. Nearly all participants in the interviews during the site visit could connect their work and role directly to the strategic plan and a future direction of the College. For example, TBCC had clear vision for and allocated resources towards the expansion of the College via new building projects in support of becoming the educational center of the Tillamook County community (1.B.4.).

Student Achievement

The college has recently hired Success Coaches with funds from a Title III grant who are dedicated to students within each of 7 Learning Communities (Guided Pathways/Meta-majors) as well as a Success Coach dedicated to transfer. Success coaches have developed several clarifying and guiding maps, worksheets, and other visuals to help students start and continue through their programs, and working to also have these visuals available on the college website. Also part of the Title III Grant, the college has developed a new student orientation that is available through the Canvas LMS. Orientation materials include relevant academic requirements, including policies and procedures around graduation and transfer. Policies and procedures around graduation and transfer are also available in the catalog on the college website (1.D.1).

TBCC has identified both regional and national peers based on four metrics of student achievement: fall-to-winter persistence, fall-to-fall retention, completion, and transfer. These metrics further align with TBCC's Educational Excellence and Workforce Development priority area within its strategic plan. Selection of peers from the Voluntary Framework for Accountability (fall-to-winter persistence) and IPEDS (other metrics) was based on meaningful criteria, such as degree types offered, enrollment, and geographical setting, and mixes of CTE/transfer students as well as traditional/non-traditional students. These data are disaggregated by gender, age groups, race and ethnicity, first-generation, and Pell-receiving students and publicly available on the TBCC website (1.D.2, 1.D.3). When disaggregating by race and ethnicity, the college compares LatinX, White, and undisclosed identities of students. Alternatively, the college might consider comparisons of race and ethnicity to all students for the various success metrics when disaggregating data. As mentioned, TBCC has yet to set and articulate meaningful indicators of its equity and inclusion goals as it relates to mission fulfillment and might consider using some of their disaggregated metrics as indicators alongside the criteria for becoming a Hispanic Serving Institution, for which TBCC has expressed an interest in becoming.

The college has recently implemented the sharing of student achievement data at its college-wide in-service sessions, providing opportunities for its faculty and staff to see how their work connects to this data and to the college's strategic plan. Furthermore, TBCC's Director Institutional Effectiveness conducts regular individualized, "Deep Dive" data sessions with departments and service areas, especially as they prepare their SAOs. During the visit, some service area representatives were better able to articulate how they obtain and use student achievement data than others, which was attributed to the number of personnel changes recently experienced by the college. One area, as an example, that could articulate their use of student achievement data was with the Title III implementation and Student Success Coaches, who have examined fall-to-winter persistence and completion data. Representatives for all areas interviewed during the visit, however, expressed intention by college leadership in the past two years to have the data viewed by the college community, and that strategies like the "placemat" not only have made data more visible and accessible, but have also been good to initiate a culture around data and reinforce the college's mission. TBCC should thus continue its

efforts around establishing a culture of data, especially student achievement data, through its in-services and “Deep Dive” sessions (1.D.4).

Programmatic Assessment

TBCC has organized academic and non-academic program review into five cohorts of four to five programs being reviewed each year. TBCC’s midcycle report included a copy of the rubric used to evaluate each program review by a subgroup of the College Council. These evaluations are shared with the entire College Council and the Board of Education. The instructional reviews are faculty driven and focus on student course data that connects to program learning outcomes (PLOs) and institution learning outcomes (ILOs) over a historical period of five or six years (1.C.5, 1.C.6).

Additionally, the process of program review involves analysis of peer institutions’ data, as seen in the General Education Program Review. The College Council provides feedback during draft process and is seen as mechanism for improvement. The evaluation team heard that because of the limited number of faculty per department, some faculty appreciated the feedback during the drafting process of Program Review. Historically, Program Review was followed up with annual one-page reports when not doing a full report. This practice has not continued recently due to changes in staffing. Moving forward, the college should consider clarifying the process for following up on program review and clarify the leadership structure involved in academic program review. While the size of the college has created challenges, the evaluation team found that there was interest in reexamining the content of the program review process for the academic programs and plans to establish a workgroup to evaluate the process.

TBCC’s Mid-Cycle report included the 2019-2020 General Education Program Review and the 2022-23 Manufacturing and Industrial Technology/ Apprenticeship (MIT) Program Review. The 2020-21 Library and Learning Services Service Area Review was also included as an example of a non-academic program review.

The evaluation team found that based on the General Education Program Review, TBCC has implemented several initiatives to improve success of students. They used the program review to restructure the supports for students, improve gateway courses, and reimagine placement in Math courses. Developmental math classes are taught using the emporium model to reduce the amount of time in developmental math classes. It is clear from the mid-cycle report that disaggregated data are used in program review to look for opportunities to improve success for different populations. For example, the General Education Program Review examined gender and race/ethnicity. This work indicates that TBCC can continue to use program review to support positive changes to academic and non-academic programs (1.C.7). The General Education Program Review also provided data needed to upgrade equipment and support a new faculty position in sciences. The Program Review also has led to discussions around Integrating writing across the curriculum as well as a change in the Learning Management System from Moodle to Canvas (1.C.7).

The 2022-23 MIT Program Review illustrates that the participants examine a variety of data, which is used to analyze the viability of the program and the long-term plans for changing the program. There were concerns of the validity of some of the data because of coding issues for apprentices. The mid-cycle report indicates that analysis within the MIT Program Review has led TBCC to increase faculty positions to support both MIT and apprenticeship programs. The curriculum of the MIT program is also being updated to align with student and industry need. Specific improvements made based on the Program Review will support the Year 7 EIE, Standard 1.C.7.

The 2020-21 Library and Learning Services Service Area Review included a review of the TBCC Library, Testing Center, and Tutoring Center. The report included eight Service Area Outcomes (SAOs) with baseline assessment and potential refinements or modifications. While current library employees were not at TBCC for the 2020-21 Service Area Review, it was indicated that the Service Area Review drove change to the tutoring model, including the addition of a learning lounge and bilingual tutors. The college responded to low-income student need by including resources in tutoring spaces.

During the visit, the evaluation team met with faculty and administrators who participated in program review as well as members of the College Council, which is responsible for reviewing the program reviews. The reports included a SWOC analysis for each of the three areas in the report. The Mid-Cycle Self-Study indicates that TBCC has added materials for health science fields because of the program review. Overall, the program reviews featured in TBCC's Mid-Cycle report illustrated clear examples of improvement and resource allocation based on evidence discovered through the program review process. These examples, including developmental English and math, science faculty and equipment, electrical faculty, were confirmed during discussions with faculty, deans, and the Vice President of Instruction during the visit (1.C.7).

TBCC included the 2022-23 Student Learning Outcome Report as supporting documentation within the Mid-Cycle report, detailing the course learning outcomes (CLOs), relevant program learning outcomes (PLOs), and the institutional learning outcomes (ILOs). The data indicate active participation by faculty in assessing student learning using Moodle, and later Canvas, and that TBCC uses the assessment data to strategically focus on improving achievement of student outcomes. Assessment is conducted at the end of every course with an ILO as well as a graduation survey. These data support the refinement of programs and courses. Conversations with TBCC faculty suggested that a high percentage of faculty were participating in assessment of student learning, though faculty-wide conversations about the results of their student learning outcomes assessment efforts may have recently paused due to Covid and personnel turnover at the college.

Within Academic Program Review for General Education, analysis of student learning outcomes is directly addressed how to improve programs. As more academic programs conduct their reviews, the college may consider more detailed analysis of PLOs and SLOs. During the visit, the

evaluators learned that a review of CLOs and PLOs were part of the approval process by TBCC's Curriculum Committee, and the Curriculum Committee Chair provided examples of Course Content and Outcomes Guides (CCOGs) as evidence. Along with similar examples, the college may also consider showcasing more examples of curriculum mapping and SLO assessment as they prepare for Standard 1.C. of their Year 7 report.

Moving Forward

The evaluation team was impressed with TBCC's commitment to its mission and vision that was expressed enthusiastically and authentically by staff, faculty, administrative leaders, and Board members. We encourage the college to continue fostering a culture of data-informed decision-making at the operational levels of the college by regularly sharing student achievement data across the college community. This can be achieved through its ongoing in-service sessions and "Deep Dive" data discussions that engage faculty and staff in analyzing and utilizing this information to inform their practices, as well as seeing how their work connects to the mission of the college. We further encourage to formalize the budget/resource allocation cycle presented as being in development during the site visit so that resource allocation is clearly tied to improving institutional effectiveness.

TBCC's strategic plan framework, which includes college-level priorities, objectives, initiatives, and indicators, has shown to be effective for measuring mission fulfillment. The plan could be further strengthened by identifying the development of meaningful indicators for its equity and inclusion priority area, potentially leveraging the criteria for becoming a Hispanic Serving Institution to inform these metrics. Additionally, TBCC might consider how its strategic plan and resource allocation process can also reflect or be better informed by student learning outcomes assessment and program review.

Finally, as TBCC prepares for its Evaluation of Institutional Effectiveness, it might consider what it might need by way of supporting documents and specific examples as evidence of meeting the NWCCU Standards and begin assembling these articles in advance of the visit.

Addendums

TBCC had no outstanding Recommendations at the time of the Mid-Cycle Peer Evaluation.